CITY OF
CLOVERDALE

MINUTES
Airport Subcommittee
Meeting Date: February 2, 2016
Meeting Time: 8:00 a.m.
Meeting Location: Cloverdale City Hall Conference Room
124 N. Cloverdale Blvd., Cloverdale CA

Subcommittee Members and City Staff

Councilmember Bob Cox, Chair
Vice Mayor Gus Wolter
City Manager Paul Cayler
Airport Manager Michael Morrissey

1. **Call to Order:** Chair, Councilmember Cox called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. Present: Chair Cox, Vice Mayor Wolter, and Paul Cayler. Absent: Michael Morrissey.

2. **Communications:** None

3. **Public Comment:** Chair Cox opened the public comment period.

   Mindy Thal, Cloverdale, read a statement (attached) and submitted a list of websites regarding lead in aviation fuel (attached).

   Robin Andersen, Cloverdale, asked that the tenant base receive an agenda prior to the meetings and, following the meetings, receive the minutes.

   Chair Cox responded that the agenda packets, including draft minutes, are posted 72 hours prior to meetings on the City's website.

   Clay Skelton, Cloverdale, stated he would like the Airport Manager to reach out to all of the pilots to inform them about meetings.

   Mark Tuma, Cloverdale, stated the decision to not raise QSP's rent was City Manager Nina Regor's decision alone and not the Airport Manager's. He added that NorCal Skydiving paid exactly what the City billed them.

   Ed Dalbec, Cloverdale Pilots Association, passed out a letter written a year ago, and stated the airport tenants pay $60,744 per year in rent, along with doing cleanup work on a volunteer basis.

   Ron Thal, Cloverdale, stated he wanted to make the committee aware of an email he sent to the Airport Manager and the response he received.

   Ed Dalbec, Cloverdale, stated the Cloverdale Lions Club is putting up an informational sign next to the fuel pump giving pilots a list of numbers to call if they need assistance at their cost.

   Chair Cox offered his appreciation to the Lion's Club.

   Vice Mayor Wolter stated he thinks some of the comments Mindy brought up should be put on the next meeting's agenda, such as the questions regarding the Red Bull event and the fuel emissions, and asked for a copy of her statement.

   Chair Cox closed the public comment period.

4. **Approval of Minutes**: The minutes for March 17, 2015, and June 2, 2015, were approved.

5. **Current Items for Discussion:**

a. Potential hangar rate adjustment: Mr. Cayler distributed a May 2015 memo from the City's account analyst and stated this item was tabled at last year's budget meeting. Mr. Cayler stated this memo still appears valid and is being brought before this committee as the City's budget season begins next month. Mr. Cayler went over the details of the memo. Mr. Cayler stated the Staff recommendation for a 7% increase for each of the next four years is prudent and reasonable.

Chair Cox asked when the last rental increase was and for what amount. The consensus of those in attendance was an approximate 7% increase occurred about five years ago.

Vice Mayor Wolter asked what amenities are offered at other airports in the area.

Mr. Cayler answered that all of the airports offer fuel. He stated that Willits, Ukiah, Sonoma County, Petaluma, Napa, and Napa have fixed-base operators and that Healdsburg and Cloverdale no not have a fixed-base operator.

Vice Mayor Wolter inquired as to which airports have gas.

Mr. Cayler replied that Healdsburg and Willits only offer AV gas and that Napa, Petaluma, Sonoma County, and Ukiah offer jet fuel.

Ed Dalbec, Cloverdale, noted that Napa and Sonoma County have FAA control towers and good asphalt access to all hangars. Mr. Dalbec stated if the City is going to raise the rate, then let's clean up the airport and make it better.

Discussion ensued about projects that are moving forward relative to the airport and the need for improvements to create a larger tenant base.

Jimmy Halliday, Cloverdale, stated he believes that Napa and Sonoma should not be included in the rate comparison as they are Class Delta airports. Mr. Halliday stated the only amenity he would like to see addressed, as a tenant, is the ground in front of the Chief's hangar, as well as NorCal's two hangars that are gravel.

Ray Shipway, Cloverdale Pilots Association, stated Ukiah and Healdsburg do not have the problems that Cloverdale does at their airports and wants the City to show what the rate increase money will be spent on.

Discussion of budget and other issues for the airport continued.

The subcommittee recommended Staff move forward with a 7% increase each year for the next four years.

Mr. Cayler stated he considers this a first touch for this year's budget and will prepare the Council's budget based on a 7% increase in hangar rates.

6. **Information Only Memos:** None

7. **Future Agenda Items (subject to change):**
   a. Aviation fuel
   b. Private hangars
   c. Fire sprinklers

8. **Pending Items:** None

9. **Good of the Order:** None

10. **Adjournment:** Adjourned to Tuesday, April 5, 2016, *or alternate date if requested.*

Read by
Mindy Thal

FOR THE PUBLIC RECORD

Subcommittee members, Mr. Cayler...

I have a short statement.
Since there probably will not be another scheduled subcommittee meeting until June, I'd like to acknowledge that many of us began this quest for quieter, more responsible and respectful piloting from NorCal almost three years ago in April 2013. At that time, we asked the airport subcommittee to request NorCal to fly more responsibly. Not to stop them, not to complain about the airport, to request politely that NorCal be a good neighbor. To date, this has not happened. The City has, in my opinion, what is called the smoke stack effect. You are responsible for a noise issue that is not actually in the city but owned and managed by the City, and it would seem the city is responsible to require businesses to whom it leases to be good neighbors.

Many people are more and more being bombarded with unconscionable noise every time NorCal takes to the skies. At first it was just those of us who live south and to the north of the city of Cloverdale. However in the last three years, more and more people from town have registered displeasure and alarm at the continuing outrageous noise.

Two questions and a few observations of events from 2015.

How much did Butterfinger pay for their video shot at the airport
Where did the money get applied for it

How much did Red Bull in fact end up paying for their 4-day event
Where did the money get applied for it

Certain subcommittee meetings last year were cancelled due to "lack of new business".

No New business?:

Last year brought us the Red Bull event which, according to Mr. Cayler himself, he began personally negotiating in January of 2015;

a new airport manager was hired

The Red Bull Event was held

The Butterfinger video was recorded

The Alexander Valley Resort with all the ramifications became a cause celebre

The Sportspark Project to repurpose the airport for the good of the many was brought forward

The on-going noise issues with NorCal have continued and grown and now the issue of lead in AVgas has arisen

The continued lease renegotiations with NorCal went on and a new lease was signed

These things happened..... but there was no new business for the airport subcommittee to meet?

Our quest for some peace..... and the quiet enjoyment of our homes....not unreasonable....was never about the airport. At subcommittee meeting after meeting, our quest was characterized as people who didn't like the noise from the airport. So once again, for the record, I'm going to state the fact that our quest has never been about airport noise, it has always and only been about the excessive noise and rude piloting by one company..... Nor Cal Skydiving.

There has been an ongoing comment at more than one public meeting, from the dais, that the legal fees caused by noise complaints have cost the city roughly $50,000. I submit, rather than cost the city $50,000 in our quest for accountability from the city, NorCal and the airport subcommittee as it relates to leases at the airport, we showed that the city was actually owed $59,300.

That is of June 30, 2015 NorCal owed $34,800.
QSP at the same time period owed $24,500.
Totaling $59,300.

This was brought to light by our repeated requests to have a valid, executed lease in place and by our forensic accounting undertaken using the the City's own budget. This does not take into account at the Red Bull approval meeting where Ms. Julie Dilley suggested the fee for the Red Bull event was embarrassingly small and suggested the city request more fees. A $5,000 additional fee was tacked on at that time.

Making a grand total of **$64,300** uncovered by our requests for accountability.

There was some minor adjustment to NorCal's rent, that will not bring the total to what was in fact owed, so it is a gift apparently.

And, there was no statement that I know of about the QSP money owed..... Other than the then airport manager, Mr Tuma suggesting that the QSP owner sleeping in his RV at the airport, is actually doing night watchman duty. Apparently that money is also being gifted to QSP.

Whether or not QSP has changed names or ownership since they began a lease, the fact remains they had not paid back rent as of June 30, 2015 and they remain at the airport.

And, whether the city billed NorCal incorrectly is not the issue.

The issue still remains two businesses at the airport were apparently gifted money from the city's coffers; money that was left on the table in NorCal's lease renegotiations and in the case of QSP, forgiven back rent.

Thank you again for your interest. Please let me know if you have any questions.
Mindy Thal

submitted by
M. Thal

Some websites to with various issues of lead in AVgas and gas used in airplanes. Although lead has been removed by legislation from automobile gasoline, no such provision has been made for stopping the use of lead in small aircraft, such as is used at the Cloverdale Airport.

http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3230438/

http://www.ufuel.com/aviation_fuel_club.phtml

http://www.oregonaviationwatch.org/OAW-About.php

http://generalaviationnews.com/2015/04/06/taxing-the-lead-out-of-100ll/#more-93538

http://www.scientificamerican.com/article/lead-in-aviation-fuel/

http://www.foe.org/news/archives/2013-06-epa-report-shows-violation-of-federal-airborne-lead-standards

https://www.faa.gov/about/initiatives/avgas

http://www.motherjones.com/blue-marble/2012/12/private-planes-still-use-leaded-gasoline